

A proposal for a card type which only allows circulation of juvenile materials

At McMillan Library we have experienced parents who use the cards of their children to check out and then accrue fines or charges on adult materials, often because their own cards have excessive charges. Our experience is that losses tend to be concentrated in adult movies and books, so that creating a card that allows only circulation of juvenile materials would address this situation.

The creation of such a card type that would allow juveniles to check out materials of interest to them without the risk that numerous adult materials might be lost. It would allow even children of parents with blocked accounts to have a standard (and thus positive) experience of using the library rather than numerically limiting their circulation as is the case with a "limited use -- juvenile" type card which is presently our only recourse.

If such an account would be more acceptable with a medium range limit on holds or checkout, that would also address the situation. We think keeping the card as close to standard as possible is easiest to administer and explain.

PATRON CATEGORY

Category code	JUMAT
Description	Juvenile Materials – only
Enrollment period	48 months
Overdue notice required	Yes
Max holds	10
Holds block threshold	20.00
Circ block threshold	20.00
Billing notice threshold	50.00
Category type	Child
Default messaging preferences	Hold filled
Total current checkouts Allowed	25

CIRCULATION ISSUING RULES – since our database contains a default circulation issuing rule that provides a 21 day loan period for any combination of patron category and item type that does not have a rule, we must provide all the CIRC rules and assign zero checkouts allowed for the non-juvenile items.

Patron Category	Item Type	Fine Amount	Fine Grace Period	Fine Charging Interval	Current Checkouts Allowed	Loan Period	Max Accruable Fine Per Issue	Expired Hold Fee	Hold Policy
Juvenile materials only	AV and other equipment	0			0		\$3.00	\$0.00	No Holds Allowed
Juvenile materials only	Art prints	0			0		\$0.00	\$0.00	No Holds Allowed
Juvenile materials only	Book on CD, adult	0			0		\$0.00	\$0.00	No Holds Allowed
Juvenile materials only	Book on CD, juvenile	0		1 day(s)	Unlimited	28 day(s)	\$0.00	\$0.00	From Any Library
Juvenile materials only	Book on cassette, adult	0			0		\$0.00	\$0.00	No Holds Allowed
Juvenile materials only	Book on cassette, juvenile	0.1		1 day(s)	Unlimited	28 day(s)	\$1.50	\$0.00	From Any Library
Juvenile materials only	Book, adult, 14 day loan	0			0		\$0.00	\$0.00	No Holds Allowed
Juvenile materials only	Book, adult, 28 day loan	0			0		\$0.00	\$0.00	No Holds Allowed
Juvenile materials only	Book, juvenile, 14 day loan	0		1 day(s)	Unlimited	14 day(s)	\$0.00	\$0.00	From Any Library
Juvenile materials only	Book, juvenile, 28 day loan	0		1 day(s)	Unlimited	28 day(s)	\$0.00	\$0.00	From Any Library
Juvenile materials only	Book, rental, 14 day loan	0			0		\$0.00	\$0.00	No Holds Allowed
Juvenile materials only	Book, rental, 7 day loan	0			0		\$0.00	\$0.00	No Holds Allowed
Juvenile materials only	Book, walk-in, 14 day loan	0			0		\$0.00	\$0.00	No Holds Allowed

Juvenile materials only	Book, walk-in, 28 day loan	0			0		\$0.00	\$0.00	No Holds Allowed
Juvenile materials only	Book, walk-in, juvenile, 14 day loan	0		1 day(s)	Unlimited	14 day(s)	\$0.00	\$0.00	No Holds Allowed
Juvenile materials only	Book, walk-in, juvenile, 28 day loan	0		1 day(s)	Unlimited	28 day(s)	\$0.00	\$0.00	No Holds Allowed
Juvenile materials only	Cassette, adult music	0			0		\$0.00	\$0.00	No Holds Allowed
Juvenile materials only	Cassette, juvenile music	0.05		1 day(s)	Unlimited	14 day(s)	\$1.50	\$0.00	From Any Library
Juvenile materials only	Compact disc, adult music	0			0		\$0.00	\$0.00	No Holds Allowed
Juvenile materials only	Compact disc, juvenile music	0.05		1 day(s)	Unlimited	14 day(s)	\$1.50	\$0.00	From Any Library
Juvenile materials only	DVD, 28 day loan	0			0		\$0.00	\$0.00	No Holds Allowed
Juvenile materials only	DVD, 7 day loan	0			0		\$0.00	\$0.00	No Holds Allowed
Juvenile materials only	DVD, juvenile, 7 day loan	0.1		1 day(s)	Unlimited	7 day(s)	\$3.00	\$0.00	From Any Library
Juvenile materials only	DVD, rental, 7 day loan	0			0		\$0.00	\$0.00	No Holds Allowed
Juvenile materials only	DVD, walk-in, 7 day loan	0			0		\$0.00	\$0.00	No Holds Allowed
Juvenile materials only	DVD, walk-in, juvenile, 7 day loan	0.25		1 day(s)	Unlimited	7 day(s)	\$3.00	\$0.00	No Holds Allowed

Juvenile materials only	Digital Audio Player, 28 day loan	0			0		\$0.00	\$0.00	No Holds Allowed
Juvenile materials only	Digital Audio Player, Juvenile, 28 day loan	0		1 day(s)	Unlimited	28 day(s)	\$0.00	\$0.00	From Any Library
Juvenile materials only	Equipment	0			0		\$0.00	\$0.00	No Holds Allowed
Juvenile materials only	ILL, 14 day loan	0.25		1 day(s)	Unlimited	14 day(s)	\$5.00	\$0.00	From Home Library
Juvenile materials only	ILL, 7 day loan	0.25		1 day(s)	Unlimited	7 day(s)	\$5.00	\$0.00	From Home Library
Juvenile materials only	Kits	0.05		1 day(s)	Unlimited	14 day(s)	\$1.50	\$0.00	From Home Library
Juvenile materials only	Magazine, adult	0			0		\$0.00	\$0.00	No Holds Allowed
Juvenile materials only	Magazine, juvenile	0		1 day(s)	Unlimited	14 day(s)	\$0.00	\$0.00	From Any Library
Juvenile materials only	Reference	1		1 day(s)	Unlimited	1 day(s)	\$5.00	\$0.00	No Holds Allowed
Juvenile materials only	Software, Adult	0			0		\$0.00	\$0.00	No Holds Allowed
Juvenile materials only	Software, Juvenile	0.2		1 day(s)	Unlimited	14 day(s)	\$3.00	\$0.00	From Any Library

Responses regarding the proposed new patron category:

MCM/Andy Barnett: McMillan likes this idea and wants to thank the people who developed it

RAN/Peggy Potter: I think it is a great idea.

MCF/Melanie Wichern: I think it would be a bonus to have a card of this type.

PCPL/Larry Oathout: After looking at the issue, I have some real concerns about the proposed Patron Category, although I understand the idea behind it.

Older children (teens) will also be punished in many cases, even though they are supposed to benefit from this new category.

MCM lists its Young Adult books as adult items, thereby shutting older children out of not only all Adult items, but all YA items, unless they change the Item Type designation of their YA items.

With some libraries using Adult Item Types for YA materials and others using Juvenile, this could cause unequal access and confusion among borrowers who go to neighboring libraries.

I would not support the plan as it stands.

FCH/Wendy Rawson: I am VERY concerned about this suggestion. Isn't it basically censoring what certain patrons can read/watch? What if I'm a pre-teen and I'm questioning my sexuality? I am not likely to find informative juvenile books to check out about homosexuality or transgender issues. The library has just cut off my access to information because you're mad that my mom didn't return some books a few years ago. I think the library should have confronted my mother when it happened and settled the issue with her at that time instead of punishing me with this patron category. It just isn't fair. The principles of librarianship should outweigh the irritation of library staff over patron behavior/materials not returned.

Heidi's response (4/20): Hi Wendy:

thanks for the input!!!! I believe the impetus for this proposal was so that some children would not have their card co-opted by their parents to check out non-juvenile materials. In all cases I have heard about the library staff have confronted one or both parents and the parents continue to trash their own cards and those of their children (ORE, MCM and MAD could share the particulars). MCM proposes this so a 7 year old can still check out "juvenile" materials.

This is not a patron category to replace with of the existing Juvenile patron categories but an additional option. Libraries do not have to assign this category to any records. Library staff do have the ability to override the blocks at check out if they don't subscribe to the limitations.

We are still gathering input so yours will be very useful. I'll be collating it all together in a document for the CSC to review.

PDS/Jennifer Way: I really appreciate MCM's desire and work to better serve children whose parents have blocked cards, but have some reservations/questions/concerns about this request for this new patron category.

What ages would this be used for - until 18? If so, would this adversely impact teenagers? They are categorized as juveniles by some libraries, but are likely to have interest in adult and teen items (which some libraries categorize as adult itypes (including books and movies). Limiting them to only juvenile items may provide them with choices that are below their reading level/interest so really wouldn't serve them. Also, how would these patron types be switched to regular patron categories upon reaching the selected age?

Libraries categorize their books in different ways; some libraries put a particular book in their teen section while others might categorize as a juvenile. This means that the same patron may be able to checkout one library's copy (if categorized as juvenile itype) but not another library's copy (if categorized as an adult itype). This seems arbitrary and confusing for a patron to be able to checkout a particular copy of a title at one library or belonging to one library, but not the same exact book from or belonging to another. (Harry Potter, for example).

The biggest concerns I have are particularly for patrons using multiple libraries. What happens if this patron with this particular patron category visits another library that does not use this category? If a library's policy says that a child can checkout whatever they want, but this patron category says they

cannot - how does this work? Can the library the patron is visiting change it to a regular card? If so, what happens when they return back to another library that does use this patron category? Each patron is only supposed to have one record in the database so I can see this difference in use of patron categories as a potential challenge.

What happens if a child with a limited use card ends up with a blocked account due to fines or a lost item? Some libraries charge fines on juvenile items while some do not, so it is possible that the cardholder will still end up with a blocked account.

Just some thoughts and questions for the committee to discuss in their consideration. I think I've heard of some libraries doing a "fresh start" or clean slate program, but am not familiar with the details of what others have done. Has MCM already considered that as a potential solution to blocked juvenile accounts?

Heidi's response (4/20): Hi Jennifer:

Really good questions and thank you so much for the thoughtful response. I've added some answers in RED below where I may have some insight. I'll add this to the response document we are collating for review at the May 8 CSC meeting.

I really appreciate MCM's desire and work to better serve children whose parents have blocked cards, but have some reservations/questions/concerns about this request for this new patron category.

- What ages would this be used for - until 18? If so, would this adversely impact teenagers? They are categorized as juveniles by some libraries, but are likely to have interest in adult and teen items (which some libraries categorize as adult itypes (including books and movies). Limiting them to only juvenile items may provide them with choices that are below their reading level/interest so really wouldn't serve them. Also, how would these patron types be switched to regular patron categories upon reaching the selected age?
 - *This is not a category to replace any existing juvenile categories but one that a library can implement if they need to. Libraries will need to create a local library policy that determines when they implement this category and when it can be/should be changed.*
- Libraries categorize their books in different ways; some libraries put a particular book in their teen section while others might categorize as a juvenile. This means that the same patron may be able to checkout one library's copy (if categorized as juvenile itype) but not another library's copy (if categorized as an adult itype). This seems arbitrary and confusing for a patron to be able to checkout a particular copy of a title at one library or belonging to one library, but not the same exact book from or belonging to another. (Harry Potter, for example).
 - *Correct. That is one of the issues. Also, what if they place a hold on an item and when it arrives they can't check it out?*
- The biggest concerns I have are particularly for patrons using multiple libraries. What happens if this patron with this particular patron category visits another library that does not use this category? If a library's policy says that a child can checkout whatever they want, but this patron category says they cannot - how does this work? Can the library the patron is visiting change it to a regular card? If so, what happens when they return back to another library that does use this patron category? Each patron is only supposed to have one record in the database so I can see this difference in use of patron categories as a potential challenge.
 - *Another good question. Library staff have the ability to override and allow checkout. There would be no need to change the patron category. The example MCM used was in reference to picture books so I don't think they were anticipating this as a category that would be used by "older" juveniles who had control of their own*

cards. More so for younger kids whose parents were using their cards to check out materials for themselves.

- What happens if a child with a limited use card ends up with a blocked account due to fines or a lost item? Some libraries charge fines on juvenile items while some do not, so it is possible that the cardholder will still end up with a blocked account.
 - *Yes, always a possibility.*

Just some thoughts and questions for the committee to discuss in their consideration. I think I've heard of some libraries doing a "fresh start" or clean slate program, but am not familiar with the details of what others have done. Has MCM already considered that as a potential solution to blocked juvenile accounts?

The initial testing for this was a change to the (Sandbox) Circulation Issuing Rules at MCM using regular JU patron category. But MCM is not the only library interested in a card/patron category with this limitation. At our last meeting ORE brought up a discussion issue about a patron category that had check out and hold between the limits of a Limited Use patron and a regular patron. After we went over the MCM proposal she decided to take that back to her library to see if it fits the needs of what they wanted to propose. Except I think they wanted an Adult category as well. Limiting the number not the materials.

All very good, I will add them to the list.

FCH/Phil Hansen: I've been mulling this over for a while, and I have some serious concerns about this proposal. We have adult patrons who abuse their children's accounts here at FCH as well, but any borrowing restriction based on content makes me very uncomfortable. Materials on sexual orientation, gender identity, LGBTQ subjects, religion, mental health issues, and many other topics would not be available to these patrons since they exist nearly entirely within adult non-fiction collections. Not to get preachy, but I feel like this is a violation of the ALA Library Bill of Rights as well, by denying access to certain materials based on a patron's age. I understand that the restriction isn't being added due to the patron's age, and that the concept behind the proposal is focused on allowing checkouts for patrons with troubled accounts, but at the end of the day these patrons won't have the freedom to read what they choose.

I have a few mechanical questions about holds, too. The attached document talks about item type restrictions on holds, but how would Teen items be effected by this? Using the print copy of *The Hunger Games* as an example, 74 copies attached to that bib record are a "book, juvenile" item type, while 35 copies have a "book, adult" item type. Would the items with the "book, adult" item type just get skipped over in the holds queue? Is there a restriction on what types of materials & bib records that JUVMAT patrons would be able to place on hold, or does the restriction happen at the point of checkout?

If this patron type was created, would we have to enforce those rules here at FCH? I would need to talk things over with Wendy and other staff members here at FCH, but my general impressions from library staff here are that we don't support the creation of this patron type, and we would prefer not to honor it here at FCH.

Anyway, thank you for asking for opinions on this, and please let me know if there's anything else you need.

WAU/Emily: ~~I don't see any problems with this. Seems like a good option to offer.~~ 5/8/2018: I've reconsidered my initial answer to the proposal for a new Juvenile Patron Category that limits check-outs to only juvenile materials. I heard some compelling arguments today against the idea, factors I hadn't considered when I first read the proposal, and I think that creating a category that limits access is too problematic.

STP/Eddie Glade:

We have reservations about approving or using this patron category. It places unnecessary limits on youth using the library to compensate for a problem that, in our experience, can be solved by a frank conversation.

- The stated problem is *some* parents' use of their children's cards when their own are blocked by fines (or nonexistent).
- The proposed solution is to block the children's cards from checking out adult materials.
- In some libraries, Young Adult materials are cataloged as "Adult."
- Additionally, many young adults are willing and able to read "Adult" materials (e.g. V.C. Andrews, Michael Crichton, and Stephen King were common authors for teens to read, at least in my generation).
- Patrons are not able to have the Adult patron category until they turn 18.
- Anyone with the JUMAT category would be blocked from checking these out.
- Although the block could be overridden, it would be a step that would have to be taken for every checkout of adult materials.
- This patron category would provide an unnecessary barrier to access and penalize the children for their parents' problems.

Our policy is simply that we do not check out Adult materials to adults on Juvenile cards. Those adults who try are told they need to use their own card. If teen or pre-teen approaches with her/his own card and wishes to check out "Adult" materials, they may do so with no questions asked. Children can still have a positive experience using the library without their parents' items getting in the way.

If the patron category were adopted, I would suggest that "DVD, juvenile, 7 day loan" have a checkout limit (ours is 10) so that patrons' fines do not get out of control.